



CITY OF THE VILLAGE OF CLARKSTON
Historic District Commission
Art Pappas Village Hall 375 Depot Road
Clarkston, MI 48346
Minutes Tuesday August 14, 2018 Meeting

Meeting called to order by C. Johnston at 7:00 P.M.

Present: K. Berry, C. Johnston, J. Meloche, R. Sowles.

Absent: M. Moon

Agenda approved with change by Johnston to move item 4) Selection of new chairperson to after item 12. Motion by R. Sowles to approve with that change; second by J. Meloche.
Approved with all ayes.

Announcements:

A public meeting on the study and assessment of historic properties was being scheduled for September. Due to the availability of presenters through MHPN and SHPO, it may now be in November or December. Arrangements are being made through the Clarkston Independence District Library and MHPN.

Public Comments: none

Approval of the Minutes for the July 10, 2018 meeting: Motion to approve without changes or additions by R. Sowles, second by K. Berry. Approved with all ayes.

Existing Applications for review and approval:

27/29 S. Main

Kevin Harrison provided a new application for approval addressing some minor changes and responding to the issues raised in the initial approval and Certificate of Appropriateness dated June 12, 2018. This was moved ahead of the discussion of 55 S. Main to expedite approval.

Harrison is now proposing the following:

1. Elimination of a new window in the north wall due to building code compliance issues.
2. The addition of four new skylights in the north side roof due to the inability to add window in the wall. Skylights will fit between the existing roof framing.
This was considered acceptable since they could be removed in the future if the building was to be restored to the original condition.
3. Replacement windows will now be Marvin Ultimate double hung aluminum clad exterior to fit

into the existing opening and replace the non-original windows that now exist.

This was considered acceptable in keeping with previous approvals for this work.

4. Cast concrete or limestone sills were being proposed with cast concrete lintels to ~~the~~ replace the existing concrete sills and lintels.

It was recommended to use concrete for both sills and lintels so they will match as they do now. It was noted that the new will have a different appearance than the existing. Mr.

Harrison said they will probably be replacing all. Many are cracked and failing. It is noted that the head lintel has a special shape which should be maintained.

5. The front masonry over the first floor opening is to be removed to inspect the steel beam that is assumed to be supporting the wall, possibly corroding, and causing the observed masonry problems. Harrison was concerned about possible replacement masonry units as the existing style is not available. It was noted that a form could be made, and new units cast to match the existing. This will need to be addressed once the condition and extent of replacement is known.

Motion by Johnston, seconded by Sowles to amend the previous approval and Certificate of Appropriateness to reflect these changes. Approved unanimously.

New Business for Discussion

55 South Main

Architect Robert Cliff of MGA Architects/Designers presented for 55 South Main (Village Dental), and provided plans, elevations and rendering for a revised building due to a tandem trailer truck running into the side and damaging the walls and roof which will need to be replaced. Mr. Cliff was the architect for the previous addition done approximately two years ago. The new plan proposes to have a full two story structure instead of the existing one story original building in the front and the two story building in the rear that was constructed less than two years ago. To the best of the commissions knowledge, the original existing building is not considered "contributing" as it was built in the mid 1950's but is in the historic district. Documented contributing structures are located on the north and south.

Concerns were expressed by the commissioners about the massing in relation to the adjacent structures and detailing that preserves the original building appearance since this appears to be what the previous HDC attempted to do. The available minutes for the previous approval (June 30 2015, July 14 2015, February 9 2016 and July 21 2016 acceptance) did not define the intent, requirements or standards for the process and approval.

It was stated by the architect that the damaged south wall and roof will need to be replaced. It was asked if the other two walls (east and north) will be used or replaced. Mr. Cliff stated that they will probably need to be rebuilt and new brick will probably be used.

Open questions still exist on massing with two stories at the front, detailing, and whether the existing brick façade and window arrangement need to be preserved. Other zoning issues still need to be addressed by the architect and city, but these are beyond the direct responsibility of the HDC. The architect was aware that the approval process will probably require multiple reviews to coordinate all the governing criteria and approvals.

Issue of Conflict of Interest regarding 42 W. Washington

C. Johnston submitted a memo commenting on and containing a discussion that occurred on Facebook between July 23 and 24, 2018 that raised issues of a possible conflict of interest in the August 8, 2017 original vote to not allow the demolition of 42 W. Washington. Since this matter is still in litigation, Mr. Johnston asked that the memo be made part of the meeting minutes in case the issue is raised in the future. Memo is attached to these minutes.

Discussion continued regarding the "exceptions" filed by city attorney Ryan in response to the Administrative Law Judge's Proposal for Decision for 42 W. Washington. This was apparently discussed at the August 13, 2018 City Council meeting. Former city council member and mayoral candidate Eric Haven asked that the commission approve the exceptions filed by attorney Ryan. It was noted that the exceptions were filed by Mr. Ryan without the review or approval of the HDC and City Council as stated at an earlier city council meeting by attorney Ryan.

The commission declined to act on this matter since this issue was not on the agenda, the commissioners would need to review the filings prior to commenting, the commissioners were not aware of what was said or done at the city council meeting the night before, and a response to this was not time sensitive since all filings and responses had already been made to SHPO who will be rendering a decision, possibly in September.

Motion by Sowles, second by Meloche to table further discussion and place the matter on the next meeting agenda when the HDC could be better informed and more able to address the situation, if required. Motion passed unanimously.

Selection of new chairperson

Cory Johnston repeated his desire to step down as chairperson due to time constraints and requirements he feels are required of the position. Jim Meloche said he would consider it after reviewing the requirements of the position and what responsibilities could possibly be delegated to others. Johnston agreed to put together a list based on his experience.

City Manager Comments

City Manager Jonathan Smith stated that the city is taking bids for new "iron" railings at the concrete Millrace wall in Depot Park and at the stairs leading from the parking lot to Main Street. His concept is that they would be round pipe with a horizontal at the top and mid height, similar to what is on Main Street at the spillway. While this would be historically the correct style to replicate what probably existed originally at the Millrace, Mr. Smith was advised that there are standards for guardrails and handrails that may not be met with this type of railing. It was suggested that he contact the City Planner and Engineer for guidance on the requirements at a public walkway and park before proceeding.

Meeting adjourned at 8:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Cory Johnston