



CITY OF THE VILLAGE OF CLARKSTON  
**Historic District Commission**  
Art Pappas Village Hall 375 Depot Road  
Clarkston, MI 48346  
**Minutes for Tuesday September 11, 2018 Meeting**

Meeting called to order by C. Johnston at 7:01 P.M.

Present: K. Berry, C. Johnston, J. Meloche, M. Moon, R. Sowles.

Approval of Agenda: Motion to approve by C. Johnston with the addition of two items: New Business – c) 39 Miller Road, d) 52 Holcomb; second by J. Meloche. Motion carried with all ayes.

Selection of new chairperson: J. Meloche nominated by C. Johnston; second by M. Moon. J. Meloche accepted the nomination. Elected as chairperson unanimously. Term to begin with October 9 meeting.

Announcements:

- 1) The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) review board is scheduled to meet September 14. However, Clarkston City Manager, Jonathan Smith, was notified that the matter of 42 West Washington will be on the agenda in January. This was verified by C. Johnston with a member of SHPO.
- 2) A presentation from MHPN has been scheduled for November 27 at the Clarkston Independence District Library (CIDL). The presenter will be Amy Arnold, Preservation Planner for SHPO. Time is yet to be determined.
- 3) Public is welcome to view painting of the mural at 18 South Main Street (Union Woodshop).

Public Comments:

- (1) Jennifer Radcliff: What are the rules for submission of an application and timing?  
Application is on-line. However, recently several applications have been incomplete. Deadline for submission is not stipulated in the application.

Motion by C. Johnston, second by M. Moon to place this on the agenda for October 9 meeting. Motion passed with all ayes. Issues to resolve include: placing deadline information on application form, explaining what is required for a complete application (e.g. required fields).

- (2) Eric Haven: Very excited about the mural at 18 South Main. Was this within the jurisdiction of the CHDC to approve? Yes, however the commission is not aware of the requirement of a permit for painting. The commission views its role as warning to the property owner and the artist to be aware of possible damage to an historical resource by painting.
- (3) David Bihl: Bricks from the 1870's are historical and paint does not protect them. C. Johnston replied that the building in question was constructed in the 1920's and should be fired brick, as the front is, but the existing surface on the south wall is not either by wear or past practices. Painting therefore should not harm what currently exists.

Approval of the Minutes:

Motion by C. Johnston to approve the minutes of the August 14, 2018 meeting with three small changes; second by J. Meloche. Approved with all ayes. Motion by J. Meloche to approve the minutes of the September 7, 2018 meeting with no changes; second by R. Sowles. Approved with all ayes.

New Business:

- (1) 55 South Main Street: Plans and photos provided by architect Robert Cliff and property owner Dr. Tiffany Danyal for discussion. Changes made after comments of the commission at the August 14, 2018 meeting include: pulled new second floor addition back 1 – 1 1/2 feet in order to decrease mass differential scale with respect to neighboring historic buildings to north and south; float second floor addition over first floor. They will demolish three facades damaged by truck impact. They are considering unpainted brick for new facades.

Three commissioners expressed concern over massing conflict with respect to the neighboring building to the north (music conservatory). C. Johnston stated that taking into account other commercial "more contemporary buildings" in the area, he did not see a problem with the scale/mass.

Public Comment from J. Radcliff: There is argument to be made for keeping an historical context of the "street scape."

Commissioner R. Sowles suggested three possibilities for them to consider:

- (a) Submit application with what they have that appears from commissioner comments would probably be denied.
  - (b) Re-think the second floor addition and try again to decrease the mass.
  - (c) Replace the building essentially as it was with changes that would allow for a second floor addition in the future when a different commission make-up may be more receptive to their plan.
- (2) 37 East Washington: Application made to enclose and roof the existing deck at rear of house. This will create an enclosed rear porch addition, decreasing size of the existing deck with a partial shed roof and new cable roof. Photo and diagrams provided by homeowner Neil Hoxsie. Based upon plans submitted and verbal information provided, motion was made by R. Sowles to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness pending completion of the application form; second by C. Johnston. Motion passed with all ayes.
  - (3) 39 Miller Road: Application for new construction with consideration given to commission comments at previous meeting. New diagrams/site plan with elevations provided by property owner Robert Stakle. Materials noted on elevation drawings. Changes include: garage moved to back of house, brick foundation, LP siding, no "fish-scale" siding. After extensive discussion particularly of materials, motion by J. Meloche to approve Certificate of Appropriateness based upon diagrams/drawings, site plan and materials submitted with the stipulation that any changes in materials would be subject to the CHDC chairman's approval; second by R. Sowles. Motion passed with all ayes.
  - (4) 52 Holcomb: No application received; homeowner not present at meeting. No action required.

Discussion of filings of exceptions by Clarkston City Attorney and responses by Lehman Investments attorney regarding Administrative Judge ruling on 42 West Washington. Motion made by M. Moon to table discussion of this issue until SHPO Board ruling in January 2019; second by K. Berry. Motion passed with all ayes.

There were public comments on this matter, particularly by Eric Haven reminding the commission that they are the "defenders of the historic district" which establishes the ambiance of the village and that this is a "serious and emotional" issue for the community. These statements were acknowledged by members of the commission.

Meeting adjourned at 9:43 PM.

Next regularly scheduled meeting is Tuesday, October 9, 2018 at 7:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,  
Michael Moon