



CITY OF THE VILLAGE OF CLARKSTON
Historic District Commission
Art Pappas Village Hall 375 Depot Road
Clarkston, MI 48346
Minutes for Tuesday October 9, 2018 Meeting

Meeting called to order by J. Meloche at 7:00 P.M.

Present: K. Berry, C. Johnston, J. Meloche, M. Moon., R. Sowles

Approval of Agenda: Motion to approve the agenda with correction of 8) b. Application for addition to rear and south side of residence; second by R. Sowles. Approved with all ayes.

Announcements:

- (1) The 42 West Washington case is scheduled for consideration at a special meeting of the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) Board in Lansing, Michigan November 2 at 10:00 A.M.
- (2) There will be a presentation by Michigan Historic Preservation Network (MHPN) and Amy Arnold (Preservation Planner for SHPO) on assessment and review of historic districts and properties. The presentation is intended for Clarkston Historic District Commission (CHDC), Clarkston City Council, Clarkston Planning Commission, and the general public. The presentation is scheduled for Tuesday, November 27 at Clarkston Independence District Library (CIDL) from 6:00 to 9:00 P.M.

Public Comments: None

Approval of the Minutes:

- (1) Motion by C. Johnston to approve September 11, 2018 meeting minutes without changes or additions; second by J. Meloche. Approved with all ayes.
- (2) Motion by C. Johnston to approve September 25, 2018 meeting minutes without changes or additions; second by R. Sowles. Approved with all ayes.
- (3) Motion by C. Johnston to approve October 9, 2018 meeting minutes with two additions:

Issues for Discussion: (1) Added to end of first paragraph: as well as requirements for building, zoning and setbacks. (2) Added to end of second sentence of second paragraph: for both building and zoning requirements.

Applications for Review and Approval:

- (1) 55 South Main Street: This is the third meeting on this issue. Presentation by architect Robert Cliffe and property owner Dr. Tiffany Danyal of revised application drawings. These revisions were based upon concerns expressed by CHDC commissioners at the September 11, 2018 meeting. The new plans feature pulling the second floor back 8 feet from the front with the formation of a balcony with glass rail and new windows. Commissioner comments included continued concern over massing/scale with respect to the North historic neighbor (conservatory), site lines to the South historic neighbor (Sutherland House) and addition of a number of diverse design elements that some believed are distracting from the historic neighbors or even jarring. Mr. Cliffe stated that he can refine the plans and return before the next regularly scheduled meeting.

- (2) 104 North Main Street: Notice of Denial was issued (vote unanimous, September 25, 2018 meeting) and forwarded to Clarkston City offices on October 4 for potential review by city attorney and subsequent delivery to the homeowner applicant. Since homeowners Mr. and Mrs. Strong were present at the meeting, they were provided with copies of the Notice of Denial and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. C. Johnston read to them the four standards that apply in this case (2, 3, 5 and 6). In response to the Strongs' request for their options, it was noted that they can restore the box bay roof to previous historical configuration or appeal to SHPO. After a SHPO ruling, either party can appeal to the District Court of Appeals.
- (3) 27 South Main Street: Changes made to storefront (i.e. single pane windows) and south lower level entrances were not included in application or Certificate of Appropriateness. Property owner was requested to respond to inquiry. Photo provided by property owner (via email) of Maccabee Building in 1908 shows large single pane storefront windows similar to the new windows at 27 South Main. However, there are still issues with the wood trim and south elevation changes. Motion by C. Johnston, second by J. Meloche to table until C. Johnston and J. Meloche discuss with owner (Kevin Harrison). Motion carried all ayes.
- (4) 22 East Church Street; New application to add gutters and downspouts where none exist currently for control of water damage. Brief discussion as to what would be historically acceptable including materials and location. Homeowner not present. Motion to table made by C. Johnston; second by J. Meloche. Motion carried all ayes.
- (5) 68 Buffalo Street: New application for addition to the rear and the south side of the residence. Commissioner comments include: massing/scale of the addition appears larger than original building; steep pitch dormer over second floor window of East (front) elevation and first floor porch door of North (right side) elevation mimic the East (front) elevation primary entrance dormer (added in 1930's) and would constitute creating a false sense of history. Homeowner (Lisa Patercsak) and designer (Dan Rush for Moscovic Building) presented site plans and diagrams. Suggestions included: remove some details (R. Sowles: may try a reverse dormer) and reduce massing of addition (e.g. lower the addition roof ridge).
- (6) 52 South Holcomb Road: New application to create a 3-4 season room in the existing front porch. Plans presented by the owner (Jennifer Gendregske) and designer (Dan Rush for Moscovic Building) include site plans and drawings for changes to the front porch: new windows, caulking, insulation, new front door (currently screen-door) and heat. Also plan a new deck in back. There is no planned change in the footprint of the house. Commission suggestions include that afterward this should still look like a front porch particularly with respect to the choice of windows. Motion by K. Berry, second by J. Meloche to table until we are provided specifications on the windows.

Further Discussion of Application Process:

- (1) City of Clarkston Construction Project checklist provided to commissioners by C. Johnston for review and comments at future meeting.
- (2) Additional suggestions from Craig Strong, Building Official
 - a. CHDC approval stamp on site copy
 - b. Approved CHDC plans with plan review
 - c. Plan review approval sent to CHDC
 - d. CHDC approval prior to final inspection.

Final Comment from J. Meloche: Received an inquiry from a Florida resident concerning purchase of the 21 North Main ("Antique Store") property. He will provide the Certificate of Appropriateness granted to current owner earlier this year.

Meeting adjourned at 9:44 P.M.

Next regularly scheduled meeting is Tuesday November 13, 2018 at 7:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Michael Moon